



Medaille College

# **Faculty Search Committee Manual**

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

Faculty Search Committee Procedures .....	1
Introduction.....	1
Step 1: Search Approval and Preliminaries .....	2
Step 2: Advertising and Recruitment Strategies .....	3
Step 3: Appointment of the Search Committee and Chair.....	3
Step 4: Conducting the Search.....	5
Step 5: Candidate Selection Process .....	6
Step 6: Reference Checks and Phone Interviews.....	7
Step 7: Conducting On-Campus Interviews with Finalists.....	8
Step 8: Committee Evaluation and Recommendation .....	9
Step 9: Criminal History Background Checks.....	10
Step 10: Prior to Making the Offer .....	10
Step 11: Making the Offer .....	11
Step 12: Search Documentation and Closure.....	12
Appendix A: Faculty Search Approval Form .....	13
Appendix B: Letter of Acknowledgment and Completed Applicant File Form.....	17
Appendix C: Confidential Faculty Candidate Rating Form; Non-Selected Candidate Summary Guidelines and Cover Page; and Reasons for Not Selecting a Candidate.....	21
Appendix D: Candidate Correspondence.....	28
Appendix E: Guidelines for Pre-Employment Inquiries.....	31
Appendix F: Search Committee Final Report Guidelines and Format .....	36

## Faculty Search Committee Procedures

### Introduction

Searches for full-time faculty positions are of critical importance to the academic mission, culture, and life of an institution. Therefore, it is imperative to conduct professional, effective searches with several primary goals in mind:

- to hire the most qualified candidates, with priority on documented or potential teaching excellence;
- to ensure the best “fit” between those offered employment and the institution’s mission, educational goals, and academic culture; and
- to identify individuals interested in a long-term commitment to the college community.

Searches should involve a collaborative effort between academic departments, academic administration, and the Office of Human Resources. Each area has important roles to play in designing, implementing, and documenting a legal, professional, and ultimately successful search process that reflects well on the college and enhances its educational mission.

The following list of 10 Practices of Successful Search Committees, published by the University of Arizona, provides a useful introduction to key elements of the search process (<http://hr2.hr.arizona.edu/01rec/srchcomm.php>):

- Committee business is kept confidential.
- The search committee chair serves as the committee spokesperson.
- The committee agrees how to make decisions early in the process.
- The position is announced widely and in multiple ways.
- Selection criteria are determined and operational definitions are established in advance of the application review.
- Committee processes are consistent from candidate to candidate.
- Committee members who possess personal information about a candidate share that information as a reference.
- Committee members recognize that there is no such thing as an “off the record” reference.
- Detailed notes are made on all screening and selection decisions and submitted at the end of the process.
- Applicants are notified in writing as soon as they have been eliminated from consideration.

The comprehensive search protocol presented below reflects best practices at over one dozen postsecondary institutions.

## Step 1: Search Approval and Preliminaries

- Department chair secures VPAA approval to conduct a search for a new or replacement full-time faculty (see approval form in Appendix A).
- The department chair asking to recruit should be prepared to (a) establish the need for the position; (b) courses to be taught by the new faculty member (major-related and/or service courses; undergraduate and/or graduate); (c) probable starting salary; (d) estimated start-up costs (e.g., computer, special instructional equipment, office furniture); and (e) space needs.
- Positions will normally be authorized for recruitment at the rank of assistant professor unless otherwise determined and approved by the VPAA.
- Approval should normally be secured no later than October 1 each fall to ensure a timely recruitment process and maximize the size and quality depth of the candidate pool. In general, positions will be advertised in October; finalists invited to campus for interviews in late January/early February, and offers made by March 1 for the following academic year.
- Once approval is secured, the department chair develops, in consultation with the director of human resources, a job description to use for advertising and a more detailed list of job roles and responsibilities. The director of Human Resources will make sure the copy meets all state and federal employment standards. Both documents must be approved by the VPAA (or his/her delegate).
- All formal advertisements should include the following job-related components:
  - Title and rank of position
  - Department where the faculty line is housed
  - Areas of disciplinary (or other) specialization sought
  - Degree level sought
  - Special experience or qualifications preferred
  - Brief description of expected teaching duties and/or other responsibilities
  - Listing of all required application materials (letter of interest, CV, official transcripts, list of references or reference letters, sample of scholarship, etc.)
  - Start date for application review (should be at least 21 days after the ad appears in publications).
  - Expected hire and start dates

- Contact information (Note: all application materials should be directed to the Office of Human Resources, not the committee chair)

## **Step 2: Advertising and Recruitment Strategies**

The department chair and the director of human resources share responsibility for developing an appropriate, cost-effective search strategy and implementing various components of it as most appropriate.

- All full-time searches should be conducted on a national basis and include an advertisement in **The Chronicle of Higher Education**, and, where possible, a discipline-specific publication.
- Use multiple recruitments sources that will reach all qualified applicants such as professional journals, professional contacts, newspapers, minority job directories, listservs, websites, and an announcement of the position to be sent to colleagues in similar departments across the country, etc.
- Target appropriate professionals and disciplines.

## **Step 3: Appointment of the Search Committee and Chair**

### **Committee Selection**

- The department chair sponsoring the search will put recommendations for search committee membership and chair in writing to the VPAA. The VPAA (or his/her delegate) will appoint the search committee members and the committee chairperson.
- Composition of the committee will normally follow these guidelines (exceptions to be approved by the VPAA):
  - Ideally, the committee will consist of 5 voting members.
  - At least four members will be full-time teaching faculty.
  - At least two members will come from the department requesting the search and at least one faculty member will come from outside the department.

Committee membership should, whenever possible, appropriately reflect the campus' faculty and staff diversity.

### **Search Committee Chair's Responsibilities**

- Articulate clearly to the committee its specific charge, its expectations, and the rules of engagement it will follow in conducting a thoughtful, professional, and ultimately effective search.
- Bear ultimate responsibility for confidentiality. Committee business must **not** be shared outside the committee except with appropriate administrators involved in the search process.
- Oversee recordkeeping and maintain the official record of all committee activities throughout the entire process.
- Manage the committee's business so as to insure a smooth, efficient search process.
- Serve as the official spokesperson—and one public voice-- for the committee with all campus constituencies.
- Identify and contact, where necessary and appropriate, additional institutional resources that may assist the search committee (e.g., director of human resources, legal counsel)
- Keep the VPAA and department chair apprized of the progress of the search and any problems or barriers encountered during it.

## Step 4: Conducting the Search

### Organizing the Search Process

- The Office of Human Resources will collect all required applicant materials and send each applicant a letter acknowledging their receipt (see Appendix B).
- The Office of Human Resources is responsible for preparing each applicant file and forwarding all completed dossiers to the search committee chair as soon as possible but no later than the published date for initial review of applications (see Appendix B).
- The Office Human Resources is responsible for notifying applicants with incomplete files about the missing items and reminding them about the review start date. The OHR will remind applicants that their file will **not** be forwarded to the search committee until it is complete.
- On or before the published date for review of candidates arrives, the chair should convene the committee, develop a realistic timeline for conducting the search, and determine the rules of conduct that will govern the search (e.g.,
- selection criteria, candidate rating forms, interview questions and formats, procedures for checking references, methods of communication with candidates and the college community at various stages in the process)

### Determining Selection Criteria and Evaluation Rubrics

- Establish the minimum screening criteria for evaluating candidates. They should be taken directly from the detailed job description provided by the department chair initiating the search.
- Avoid indefensible screening standards such as age, race, and gender.
- Determine prioritized checklist of selection criteria in advance of the initial review of applications and discuss the relative importance and weighing of each in evaluating and ranking candidates. Consult with the department chair during this process.
- Develop operational definitions of each criteria to insure common understanding and expectations and to maintain objectivity and fairness.
- Be consistent in applying the selection criteria and procedures to each candidate to insure consistency.
- Use an objective, criterion-referenced evaluation instrument.

## **Step 5: Candidate Selection Process**

### **Narrowing the Field**

- Begin with an initial review of all completed applicant files by every committee member. To insure thorough documentation throughout the process, the committee is required to complete a Confidential Faculty Candidate Rating Form for every applicant (see Appendix C). The completed forms will be placed in the candidate file.
- Eliminate the candidates who do not meet minimum requirements.
- Based on the size and quality depth of the pool of viable candidates, determine the next steps for continued assessment and prioritization of applicants. Decide whether one or more rounds of cuts are necessary to generate a manageable short list of semifinalists (8-10) for reference checks and then phone interviews. The committee chair is required to keep a running record of non-selected candidates throughout the stages of the selection process (see Appendix C for recommended report format and guidelines).
- Contact semifinalists to determine if they remain interested in the position and to alert them that the committee is starting reference checks.

### **Communication with Candidates**

- As candidates are eliminated, the director of human resources is responsible for sending letters to those eliminated from further consideration in a timely manner. Regret letters should be courteous and express appreciation for the applicants' efforts and accomplishments (see Appendix D for sample letters).
- Communications should focus on what the committee was seeking, not what the candidate is lacking.
- Applicants treated in a courteous, respectful, professional manner are less likely to be angry or file a complaint.
- Questions about why an applicant was not forwarded in the process or selected should be directed to the committee chair and the Office of Human Resources for handling.



## Step 6: Reference Checks and Phone Interviews

### Checking References

Committee members share the responsibility for all reference checking.

- Check references **before** conducting phone or on-campus interviews.
- Check with candidates to secure their approval for reference checks before beginning calls to protect the candidate's confidentiality.
- While the committee is not obliged to confine reference checks to the names supplied, ask a candidate's permission (out of professional courtesy and in deference to confidentiality) to check additional references at the committee's discretion.
- Contact the same number of references for each candidate.
- Maintain complete evaluative notes of all phone interviews for the search file.

### Preparation for Phone Interviews

- It is recommended that committees conduct phone interviews with semifinalists in order to select the finalists to be invited for a formal campus interview.
- **Prepare questions in advance.**
- Use a common set of core questions with each candidate. The interview process must be consistent for all candidates.
- Avoid improper and illegal questions (see Appendix E for allowable questions table).
- Ask questions that require a candidate to demonstrate competencies considered essential for job performance.
- Ask questions that elicit evidence of a candidate's pedagogy and competence in curricular design and assessment, commitment to service, and scholarly activities germane to the college's promotion criteria.
- Allow candidates sufficient opportunity to ask questions.

## **Step 7: Conducting On-Campus Interviews with Finalists**

After conducting phone interviews, the committee should re-assess the pool based on revised, updated written evaluation from the committee and then create a list of finalists.

- Typically no more than 3 finalists should be invited to campus for a full-day interview without permission from the VPAA (or his/her delegate).
- As in previous step, the committee should prepare a set of suitable, common “core” questions for use with each finalist.

### **Interview Schedule**

- The interview schedule should be the same for each candidate and typically include meetings (of variable formality and time) with an appropriate range of key campus constituencies, including the search committee, department members, students, the Promotion Committee, the faculty, the director of human resources, and the VPAA (or his/her delegate).
- Candidates should also teach a lesson to a class or make a short campus presentation as part of the interview process.
- Questions about rank and salary, credit toward promotion, moving expenses should be referred to the VPAA.

### **Search Amenities**

- The committee is responsible for arranging an on-campus lunch and/or off-campus dinner with committee members for each candidate. The Office of Human Resources will handle lodging and transportation for each candidate.
- Human Resources will provide finalists with an information packet that includes a detailed job description, information about the department and the college, and about the Buffalo-Niagara region in advance of their visit.
- Arrange the visit carefully in order to create a good impression of the college. Remember candidates are interviewing us, too. We need to convince them that the college is a good place to work and the area a desirable one to live in.

## Step 8: Committee Evaluation and Recommendation

After the on-campus interviews are completed, the committee should reflect carefully and deliberately on the merits of each candidate.

- The committee should have a formal mechanism by which **all** constituencies who have participated in the on-campus interview process can communicate their evaluation of the candidates back to it (e.g., e-mails, rating form, oral debrief with a committee member). Keep all communications confidential.
- The search committee should consider all written and oral feedback in its final deliberations and decision-making process.
- The search committee is required again to complete a candidate rating form for each finalist.
- Before making its final recommendation to the VPAA (or his/her delegate), the committee will meet with the department chair to discuss the finalists in relation to the stated selection criteria and examine the feedback received on each candidate.
- After consulting with the chair and reviewing all evaluation feedback, the search committee will determine which of the finalists should be forwarded for recommendation to the VPAA (or his/her delegate).
- Through its chairperson, the search committee should normally present its recommendation for hire—in writing-- to the VPAA (or his/her delegate) within five working days of the final candidate interview. It should present the VPAA (or his/her delegate) with a ranked list of finalists whom it deems qualified for the position.
- The committee **must** also submit at the conclusion of the search a written summary report that provides rationale for its recommendations and that analyzes the strengths and weaknesses of each finalist (see Appendix F for final report guidelines and recommended format). In addition, the committee should indicate any finalists eliminated from consideration in its final deliberations and have a rationale for their elimination.
- The committee has the option of not recommending any of the candidates and proposing an extension of the search or its suspension and re-opening at a later date. The committee should have a strong rationale for such a recommendation. The VPAA shall make a final determination.

## **Step 9: Criminal History Background Checks**

The College seeks to provide a safe and professional environment for students, faculty, administrators, hourly personnel, and visitors. To accomplish this, the College conducts criminal background checks for all prospective new hires to identify individuals who may have committed serious crimes that would disqualify them from employment by law or because their presence in the workplace would create an unacceptable risk. Background information that is falsely reported by an applicant may be cause for termination of employment.

At the time of being invited for an on campus or telephone interview, applicants will be notified of the College's policy on criminal history background checks. At the time of the interview, applicants will be required to complete the Authorization and Release for Criminal History Investigation Form. The completed form will be maintained in the Human Resources Office. Human Resources will facilitate the completion of criminal history background checks for all new hires. Once a final candidate is selected and the references have been completed, the Human Resources Office will notify the Director of Public Safety to request a criminal history background check. This check is performed in order to verify the individual's identity; as a step toward protecting the safety of existing staff, faculty, and students; as well as, reducing legal risks associated with hiring. Background information that is falsely reported may be cause for rescinding the offer of employment.

If a criminal history has been reported by the applicant and/or the criminal history background check uncovers potential problems, the Human Resources Office will consult with legal counsel to determine the next course of action. With regard to faculty appointments, the Vice President for Academic Affairs will consult will legal counsel. Each case will be reviewed and factors will be considered such as, but not limited to, the nature and age of the crime reported, the position sought and duties, rehabilitation, the candidate's employment history, and references.

Criminal history reports will be maintained in a secure file in the Human Resources Department. A candidate who is judged not to qualify for a position or is not hired because of the criminal history background check may request in writing a copy of the report from the Human Resources Office.

## **Step 10: Prior to Making the Offer**

Before a contract is offered, the College reserves the right to check references beyond those provided by the candidate.

## Step 11: Making the Offer

- The VPAA retains final decision-making authority and reserves the right not to accept a search committee's recommendation. If the VPAA does not agree that any of the forwarded candidates is viable, he/she will consult with the search committee and put his/her rationale in writing.
- The VPAA (or his/her delegate) will make the offer of employment on behalf of the college. Once an offer is accepted, the VPAA (or his/her delegate) will notify the committee chair and the appropriate department head.
- Should none of the recommended candidates accept the offer, the VPAA (or his/her delegate) will consult with the department chair and the search committee to determine an appropriate course of action.
- When an offer is accepted verbally, the VPAA will have a letter of employment (i.e., contract) sent to the candidate and notify the Office of Human Resources. A copy of the signed, returned contract will be distributed to the Human Resources Office and the Payroll Office.

## Step 12: Search Documentation and Closure

- Once the search chair is informed that the position has been filled, Human Resources will notify any remaining finalists by phone and then by formal letter of the outcome and thank them for their interest in the college.
- The chairperson is responsible for bringing a successful search to closure by gathering and organizing all related documents into a final, comprehensive search file for return to the Office of Human Resources.
- As proper documentation is critical, the chair should collect and organize appropriately all informal meeting notes and formal candidate evaluation documents from each committee member as well as similar documents from all individuals from whom the committee solicited responses.
- Return to the Office of Human Resources a completed file for each candidate and a general, summary file.
- The final search report to the Office of Human Resources should indicate:
  - the total number of completed applications received;
  - how many candidates were interviewed by phone;
  - how many candidates received invitations for an on-campus interview; and,
  - how many were interviewed.
- The summary report should also discuss any major disagreements within the committee about the candidates or how the search process was conducted.
- The Office of Human Resources will archive the final search materials for three years, at which time the material may be destroyed.

## **Appendix A: Faculty Search Approval Form**

**Medaille College**  
**Faculty Search Approval Form**

**Section I Department Request** (completed by department chair)

Department: \_\_\_\_\_

New line: \_\_\_\_\_ Replacement: \_\_\_\_\_

Position (rank and title): \_\_\_\_\_

Position description (including minimum and preferred qualifications):

Rationale:



Recommended search committee members:

1. \_\_\_\_\_
2. \_\_\_\_\_
3. \_\_\_\_\_
4. \_\_\_\_\_
5. \_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_ Date: \_\_\_\_\_  
Department chair signature

\*\*\*\*\*

**Section II Action by VPAA**

The VPAA will notify the appropriate department of his/her decision in a timely manner.

Request approved \_\_\_\_\_ Denied \_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_  
VPAA signature

Date: \_\_\_\_\_

\*\*\*\*\*

**Section III Notification of Human Resources**

The VPAA will notify the Office of Human Resources of approved faculty searches by forwarding a signed copy of this form to the director. Receipt of this form authorizes the director of human resources to place a job announcement and initiate the search process.

The HR director acknowledges receipt of the approval form by signing and dating it below.

\_\_\_\_\_  
Director of Human Resources

Date: \_\_\_\_\_

**Appendix B: Letter of Acknowledgment and Completed  
Applicant File Form**

«Date»

«Salutation» «FirstName» «LastName»

«Address»

Dear «Salutation» «LastName»:

Thank you for your interest in the position of [ ] at Medaille College.

**Option A:** We have received from you all of the required application materials and your completed file has been forwarded to the search committee for review.

**Option B:** However, your file is incomplete and cannot be forwarded to the search committee until you provide the following mission element(s):

Please submit any missing materials as soon as possible to insure your full consideration for the position.

My office will keep you informed of your status in a timely manner as the search process moves forward.

Sincerely,

Barbara J. Bilotta

Director of Human Resources

«Date»

«Salutation» «FirstName» «LastName»

«Address»

Dear «Salutation» «LastName»:

Thank you for your interest in Medaille College as evidenced by the recent submission of your letter and resume for the «Jobtitle» position.

Your application will be forwarded to the search committee for review. Upon completion of this process, Barbara Bilotta, Director of Human Resources, will then schedule interviews with those candidates whose background and experience appear to be most closely related to our needs.

We sincerely appreciate your interest in working for Medaille College, and we wish you success in your search for a rewarding position.

Sincerely,

Jeanine A. Main

H R Assistant

/jam

**Medaille College**  
**Completed Applicant File Form**

(completed by Human Resources)

Document

Date Received

To be considered complete and eligible for forwarding to the search committee, a candidate file must include each the following mandatory elements:

Letter of Application \_\_\_\_\_

Curriculum vitae \_\_\_\_\_

List of professional references \_\_\_\_\_

The following elements are optional unless otherwise specified in the job announcement. If any required element is not submitted, then a file is to be considered incomplete.

Letters of reference \_\_\_\_\_

Transcripts \_\_\_\_\_

Samples of work \_\_\_\_\_

Other \_\_\_\_\_

Completed by: \_\_\_\_\_

Date: \_\_\_\_\_

**Appendix C: Confidential Faculty Candidate Rating Form;  
Non-Selected Candidate Summary Guidelines and Cover Page;  
and Reasons for Not Selecting a Candidate**

**MEDAILLE COLLEGE**  
**CONFIDENTIAL FACULTY CANDIDATE RATING FORM/Status Report**  
**SUMMARY OF CANDIDATE'S EDUCATION/EMPLOYMENT HISTORY**

Candidate No. \_\_\_\_\_ Candidate Name \_\_\_\_\_ Position \_\_\_\_\_ Current Institution \_\_\_\_\_

Degree(s) and Field(s) \_\_\_\_\_ Previous Positions/Institutions \_\_\_\_\_  
 \_\_\_\_\_  
 \_\_\_\_\_  
 \_\_\_\_\_

**EVALUATION OF CANDIDATE'S QUALIFICATIONS**

Using the quantitative rating scale provided, evaluate the degree of congruence between the candidate and the standards and qualifications for a full-time faculty position at Medaille College listed below. The scale moves from low to high.

1=Unacceptable    2=Below Average    3=Average    4=Above Average    5=Superior    N/A=Not Applicable NBJ=No basis for judgment at this point in process

POSITION CRITERIA	1	2	3	4	5	NOTES/OBSERVATIONS ON CANDIDATE'S EXPERIENCE AND STRENGTHS/ WEAKNESSES (use back of sheet as needed)
Academic preparation, earned degree						
Teaching experience						
Teaching effectiveness (documented or potential for)						
Commitment to quality instruction and student learning						
Scholarly achievements (documented or potential for)						
Service to institution/profession (documented/potential for)						
Relevant professional work experience						
Commitment to/congruence with departmental mission, goals, and objectives, core values, guiding principles						



Commitment to/congruence with college's mission, strategic vision, culture						
Ability to enhance quality of department						
Communications skills						
Interpersonal skills						
Leadership abilities						
Administrative/special project experience (e.g., experience as department chair, director of special program, grant writing experience, program review, curriculum development, retention, etc.)						
Other:						
Other:						

**Total Score**

Evaluator recommends advancing candidate to next stage of selection process \_\_\_\_\_ yes \_\_\_\_\_ no

Committee Members Names:

\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

Date:

Candidate was not selected for continuing because:

\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

**Medaille College**  
**Non-Selected Candidate Summary Report Guidelines and Cover Page**  
(Completed by search committee chairperson)

Search Title: \_\_\_\_\_

Department: \_\_\_\_\_

Search Committee Chair: \_\_\_\_\_

Committee Members: \_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_

At each juncture in a search that applicants are eliminated from future consideration, the chair of the search committee is required to update the list of non-selected candidates and indicate briefly the primary reasons for not forwarding individuals to the next stage in the review process.

The following format is provided as a recommended model for documenting committee decisions in a specific, useful, and simple manner.

List the name of each eliminated candidate and next to the name identify the primary reasons by selecting from the coded list of common reasons provided on the attachment. As necessary, indicate any reason(s) not cited in the list.

**Suggested Report Format**

Candidate's Name	Reasons for Non-Selection

## **Reasons for Not Selecting a Candidate**

### **Academic and Professional Qualifications**

- A-1 Did not meet minimum degree credentials requirement
- A-2 Did not possess terminal degree in the field or appropriately related degree
- A-3 Not making timely or satisfactory progress toward completion of terminal degree
- A-4 Insufficient evidence of ability to meet minimum position qualifications
- A-5 Lacks sufficient, relevant professional work experience required/preferred

### **Teaching and Professional Expertise**

- B-1 Insufficient teaching experience compared to other candidates
- B-2 Lack of interest in/commitment to teaching as professional priority
- B-3 Lack of teaching effectiveness necessary for position
- B-4 Did not demonstrate adequate mastery of area content knowledge and skills
- B-5 Areas of specialization do not best match current program/department needs

### **Service and Scholarship**

- C-1 Insufficient evidence of/potential for institutional service
- C-2 Lack of publications or other kinds of recognized, accepted professional scholarship and development
- C-3 Does not show sufficient potential for scholarly/professional development activities
- C-4 Service record less distinguished than other candidates
- C-5 Quantity and quality of scholarship less impressive than other candidates

### **References**

- D-1 Lack of appropriate professional references provided
- D-2 References not as strong as other candidates
- D-3 Reference checks uncovered areas of concern

### **Personal Presentation**

- E-1 Demonstrated insufficient written and/or oral communication skills
- E-2 Inability to articulate strengths and explain suitability for the position
- E-3 Demonstrated poor interpersonal skills suggesting inability to function well as a teacher and professional colleague
- E-4 Lack of professionalism

**Range and Depth of Experience and Skills**

- F-1 Lacked breadth and depth of higher education and/or professional work experiences of value and benefit long-term to institution compared to other candidates
- F-2 Lacked range of additional, special aptitudes, skills, and talents of institutional value and benefit compared to other candidates

**Lack of Fit**

- G-1 Candidate demonstrated lack of compatibility with program/department colleagues, mission, and culture
- G-2 Candidate's experience, professional interests, career path, values, etc. are not sufficiently congruent with institutional mission and culture

## **Appendix D: Candidate Correspondence**

«Date»

«Salutation» «Firstname» «Lastname»

«Address»

Dear «Firstname»:

Thank you for allowing us the time to meet with you regarding the «Jobtitle» position at Medaille College. We appreciated the opportunity to talk with you personally about your qualifications and our position needs.

The decision was a difficult one to reach; however, at this time the committee has selected another candidate whose background is more closely related to the needs of the College.

Thank you again for your interest in Medaille College. Your resume will remain on file for one year pending future positions in this area.

We wish you the best of luck in your future endeavors.

Sincerely,

Barbara J. Bilotta  
Director of Human Resources

BJB/jam

«Date»

«Salutation» «Firstname» «Lastname»

«Address»

Dear «Salutation» «Lastname»:

Thank you for your patience in awaiting the results of the «Jobtitle» position at Medaille College.

Following a thorough review of all the resumes, the search committee has interviewed and selected another candidate whose experience and background are most closely related to the needs of the College.

We sincerely appreciate your interest in working for Medaille College and will retain your resume for possible future positions.

Sincerely,

Barbara J. Bilotta  
Director of Human Resources

BJB/jam



## **Appendix E: Guidelines for Pre-Employment Inquiries**

**•MEDAILLE COLLEGE**

**•18 AGASSIZ CIRCLE**

**•BUFFALO, NY 14214**

**•GUIDELINES FOR PRE-EMPLOYMENT INQUIRIES**

Faculty search committee members should be guided by the table below when asking pre-employment questions of candidates. Committee member should use vigilance in asking legal, allowable questions to protect applicants' rights and the integrity of the search process.

**Source acknowledgment:**

The guidelines provided below for legally allowable questions have been taken nearly verbatim from MIT's Personnel Policy Manual, Section 2.5: Interviewing Policies and Procedures (<http://web.mit.edu/personnel/www/policy/2-5.html>). These guidelines will be revised periodically, as federal and state requirements change.

**ALLOWABLE QUESTIONS**

<b>SUBJECT</b>	<b>WHAT MAY BE ASKED</b>	<b>WHAT MAY NOT BE ASKED</b>
	Are you over 18 (or 21 for certain	How old are you? What is the date of your birth?
Gender	n/a	A pre-employment inquiry as to gender on an application form.
Experience	Inquiry into work experience. Inquiry into countries applicant has visited.	n/a
National Origin	n/a	Inquiry into applicant's lineage, ancestry, national origin, descent, parentage, or nationality; nationality of parents or spouse; applicant's native language
Religion	n/a	Inquiry into an applicant's religious denomination, affiliation, church, parish, pastor, or religious holidays observed. Avoid any questions regarding organizations and/or affiliations that would identify religions.
Marital Status	n/a	Are you married? Where does your spouse work? What are the ages of your children, if any? What was your maiden name?

SUBJECT	WHAT MAY BE ASKED	WHAT MAY NOT BE ASKED
Disability	Specific questions related to job duties (e.g. Do you have a driver's license? Can you lift fifty pounds?)	Do you have a disability? Have you ever been treated for the following diseases? (Listing diseases.) Has any member of your family ever had any of the following diseases?
Name	Have you ever worked for Medaille College under a different name? Is any additional information relative to change of name, use of an assumed name, or nickname necessary to enable a check on your work record? If yes, explain.	Original name of an applicant whose name has been changed by court order or otherwise. Maiden name of a married woman. Has applicant ever worked under another name, state name, or address?
Address or Duration of Address	Applicant's place of residence.	Do you rent or own your home? How long at each particular address?
Birthplace	n/a	Birthplace of applicant. Birthplace of applicant's parents, spouse, or other close relatives.
Photograph	n/a	Requirement that an applicant affix a photograph to the employment application at any time before hiring.
Education	Inquiry into the academic, vocational, or professional education of an applicant and the public and private schools he or she has attended.	n/a
Citizenship	Are you legally authorized to work in the United States?	Inquiry as to country of citizenship. Whether an applicant is a naturalized or native-born citizen; the date when the applicant acquired citizenship. Requirement that applicant produce naturalization papers or first papers. Whether parents or spouse are naturalized or native-born citizens of the United States. The date when such parents or spouse acquired citizenship.
Language	What languages do you read fluently? Write fluently? Speak fluently?	Inquiry into how applicant acquired ability to read, write, or speak a foreign language.

SUBJECT	WHAT MAY BE ASKED	WHAT MAY NOT BE ASKED
Height, Weight, Strength	Questions regarding height, weight, or strength may be asked only if the employer can prove these requirements are necessary to do the job.	n/a
Relatives	Names of applicants relatives already employed by Medaille College.	Names, addresses, ages, number, or other information concerning applicant's children or other relatives not employed by Medaille College
Notice of Case of Emergency	Name and address of person to be noticed in case of an accident or emergency.	n/a
Military	Have you ever been a member of the armed services of the United States or in a state militia? If so, did your military experience have any relationship to the position for which you have applied?	Inquiry into an applicant's general military experience or type of discharge.
Character	Have you ever been convicted of a felony? If so, when, where, and what was the disposition of the offense? Have you been convicted of a misdemeanor during the last five years, except for a first conviction for simple assault, disturbing the peace, drunkenness, speeding, or other minor traffic violations? Have you been convicted of a misdemeanor which occurred more than five years prior to the date of application where your term of imprisonment was completed less than five years prior to the date of application?	Have you ever been arrested? (an employer's use of an individual's arrest record to deny employment would, in the absence of business necessity, constitute a violation of the human rights law).
Organizations	Are you a member of any professional societies or organizations, etc.? (Exclude organizations, the name or character of which indicates the race, creed, color, or national origin of its members.)	Inquiry into applicant's membership in nonprofessional organizations (e.g. clubs, lodges, etc.).
References	Name of appropriate employment references.	n/a



## **Appendix F: Search Committee Final Report Guidelines and Format**

### **Medaille College**

The search committee is required to submit a final report to the VPAA and Human Resources Office at the conclusion of a search, whatever the outcome. In the case of a successful search resulting in a hire, the report must include the following elements:

- the name of the individual hired and a brief narrative explanation for the choice
- the names of all the other semifinalists and finalists (those interviewed on campus) with a narrative explaining briefly (a) why these candidates either were not selected, (b) why they withdrew from the search or (c) why they rejected the college's offer of the position, as appropriate
- a priority ranking of the candidates interviewed on campus and a priority ranking of all candidates from the semifinalist stage on, including those who withdrew or rejected an offer
- the final candidates' rating forms from each committee member, a summary of the strengths and weaknesses of each
- finalist as perceived by the committee collectively (the search committee's final findings may be presented in a short narrative or a comparative chart ) that supports the committee's ranking of finalists of strengths and weaknesses.
- a summary of evaluative feedback received on the candidates interviewed on campus from all other campus constituencies
- list of all candidates eliminated before the identification of a "short list" of semifinalists invited for phone interviews and the reasons why the committee did not advance them in the selection process
- any summative comments about the candidate pool, the functioning of the committee, significant points of disagreement among committee members (if any) and the effectiveness of the search process should be included in the final report, too.
- A suggested model for the final search committee report is attached.

**Search Committee Final Report**

**Section I Candidate Hired**

Name: \_\_\_\_\_

Was candidate the committee's No. 1 choice: \_\_\_\_ yes \_\_\_\_ no

Explanation of hire:

Attach to the report a final, composite committee rating form for the candidate.

## Section II Non-Selected Finalists and Semifinalists

List the remaining candidates in these categories in prioritized order from highest to lowest. Use the following codes to indicate one of three broad areas of non-selection: **PNO** = position not offered, **CWC** = candidate withdrew from consideration, or **CRO** = candidate rejected offer. Finally, provide a brief summary of each candidate's strengths and weaknesses. (Append to the report the final ratings sheets from each committee member for the candidates interviewed on campus.)

1. Name: \_\_\_\_\_ Non-selection code: \_\_\_\_\_

Summary of strengths and weaknesses:

2. Name: \_\_\_\_\_ Non-selection code: \_\_\_\_\_

Summary of strengths and weaknesses



3. Name: \_\_\_\_\_

Non-selection code: \_\_\_\_\_

Summary of strengths and weaknesses

4. Name: \_\_\_\_\_

Non-selection code: \_\_\_\_\_

Summary of strengths and weaknesses

5. Name: \_\_\_\_\_

Non-selection code: \_\_\_\_\_

Summary of strengths and weaknesses

6. Name: \_\_\_\_\_  
Summary of strengths and weaknesses

Non-selection code: \_\_\_\_\_

7. Name: \_\_\_\_\_  
Summary of strengths and weaknesses

Non-selection code: \_\_\_\_\_

8. Name: \_\_\_\_\_  
Summary of strengths and weaknesses

Non-selection code: \_\_\_\_\_

9. Name: \_\_\_\_\_

Non-selection code: \_\_\_\_\_

Summary of strengths and weaknesses

10. Name: \_\_\_\_\_

Non-selection code: \_\_\_\_\_

Summary of strengths and weaknesses

11. Name: \_\_\_\_\_

Non-selection code: \_\_\_\_\_

Summary of strengths and weaknesses

12. Name: \_\_\_\_\_

Non-selection code: \_\_\_\_\_

## Summary of strengths and weaknesses

**Section III    Campus Feedback on Finalists**

Summarize the evaluative feedback solicited from various campus constituencies who met with the final candidates during on campus interviews. Focus on similarities to or significant differences, if any, from perceptions of search committee members.

**Section IV    List of All Candidates Not Selected by the College**

Attach to the report a list of all the candidates eliminated from consideration for a campus interview by the search committee using the guidelines and codes presented in the **Faculty Search Committee Procedures Manual** (Appendix C).

**Section V    Final Comments**

The committee is invited to include any final thoughts or concerns about the search, from the candidate pool, to points of disagreement among committee members, to the overall effectiveness of the search process. Observations are welcome on any element of the search process. Attach additional page(s) as needed.